Executive Summary
RTSRP

Prepared for:
North Central Texas Council of Governments

Prepared by:
HDR
17111 Preston Road
Dallas, Texas 75248
(972) 960-4400

Prepared in cooperation with the Regional Transportation Council, NCTCOG, and the Texas Department of Transportation.

"The contents of this report reflect the views of the authors who are responsible for the opinions, findings, and conclusions presented herein. The contents do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the Regional Transportation Council, NCTCOG, and the Texas Department of Transportation".

Contact:
Leslie Pollack, P.E., PTOE
Texas PE # 101285

HDR
Texas Registration #F-754

April 2014
1.0 Introduction

The North Central Texas Council of Governments (NCTCOG) contracted HDR, Inc. to provide assistance to local agencies to coordinate traffic signal timing for 235 traffic signals along various corridors within the Metroplex. This summary covers traffic signals operated by Carrollton, Irving, Plano, Fort Worth, Dallas, Lake Worth, the Fort Worth, and Dallas Districts of the Texas Department of Transportation (TxDOT). Figure 1 illustrates the locations of these traffic signals. This project has improved progression along these arterial streets without regard to jurisdictional boundaries.

2.0 Project Scope

The assigned intersections were grouped into designated corridors that ranged in size from 6 to 44 intersections. For each corridor, the scope included the following tasks:

- A baseline assessment to document the conditions as of the beginning of the project.
- Development, implementation, and fine-tuning of the new signal timing plans.
- An after assessment to quantify and document the project results.

3.0 Data Collection

The project included extensive data collection:

- For all intersections, peak-hour turning movement counts were made by human observers who used electronic count boards to record the number of vehicles by approach direction and by movement (i.e., left turn, straight through, or right turn).

- Bi-directional machine counts were made with pneumatic tube-type counters that digitally record the number of vehicles in 15-minute increments, totaled on an hourly basis. These included seven-day counts, 24-hour counts, and vehicle classification counts.

- As one means of measuring the benefits of the project, travel time runs were made with an instrumented vehicle. The software electronically recorded the vehicle’s speed, the distance traveled, and the number and elapsed time of each stop.

4.0 Signal Timing Plans

For all corridors, new timing plans were developed for the AM and PM peaks plus the weekday midday peak in many cases. In some cases, separate versions of the AM and midday plans were required for times when school speed zones are in operation. Some corridors required timing plans for other periods such as the Saturday afternoon peak or the late evening off-peak. After the new timing plans were operational, extensive “fine-tuning” was performed to improve actual on-street performance.
5.0 Project Results

5.1 Travel Time Runs

The project results were measured quantitatively through the travel time runs made with an instrumented vehicle traveling at the pace set by other traffic. The “before” runs were made at the start of the project prior to any changes in the previous signal timing. Later, after the new signal timing plans had been installed and fine-tuned, the “after” runs were made. A comparison of the “before” and “after” travel time runs determined that the following reductions had been attained in travel time, stops, and delay:

- Travel Time
  - Weekday
    - 10 percent overall reduction
    - 9,453 seconds (158 minutes) reduction per day
    - 4,961 vehicle-hours reduction per day
  - Saturday
    - 5 percent overall reduction
    - 1,144 seconds (19 minutes) reduction per day
    - 320 vehicle-hours reduction per day

- Stops
  - Weekday
    - 25% percent overall reduction
    - 200 stops reduction per day
    - 365,310 vehicle-stops reduction per day
  - Saturday
    - 7% percent overall reduction in number of stops
    - 24 stops reduction per day
    - 20,719 reduction per day

Some corridors experienced an increase in travel time, stops, and delay during the “after” travel time runs including Wheatland, SH 183, and FM 1220.

5.1.1 SH 183
On US 183 during the AM peak period travel times, stops, and delays increased. This was due to the fact that the vehicle recording the “after” travel time data did not begin the westbound direction run at the start of green. This caused variability in the results which explains the significant increase in stops. Separate unofficial “after” travel time runs were recorded by HDR during the AM peak period fine tuning. These runs yielded an average travel time run of 24 seconds better (6% decrease) than the before travel time runs. During the weekend peak, average travel times and delays increased. The Saturday peak period was set to run free due to complaints of large waiting times on side streets. While setting the corridor to run free would increase travel times and main street delay, the side streets would be served much faster, thereby reducing waiting time.

5.1.2 FM 1220
During the Saturday peak, the intersection of Boat Club Road and Azle Avenue required a larger cycle length than the remainder of the FM 1220 corridor. As a result, the 820 interchange served as a boundary intersection between the two control groups operating at different cycle lengths. Based on a review of the travel time videos, it was determined that on Saturday southbound FM 1220 travel times runs, the driver
stopped at the IH 820 interchange. On three of the four runs, the driver sat for 95 seconds or longer. The time of arrival at the 820 interchange is completely random since the driver is crossing between control areas. Vehicles could just as easily not stop at all, as happened on the other run.

5.1.3  Wheatland Road
Operations on Wheatland Road were sacrificed to benefit the I-20 frontage roads and nearby Hampton Road which accommodate higher traffic volumes than Wheatland Road. This is reflected in the PM and Weekend period “after” travel time results.

5.1.4  Plano Parkway
Performance along Plano Parkway showed both improvements and declines based on direction of travel and peak period. The mixed results shown along Plano Parkway were due to prioritization of signal timing coordination along Preston Road, the higher volume corridor. Modifications made to improve Plano Parkway further would negatively impact Preston Road and were therefore not implemented.

5.2  Synchro™ Version 8.0 Measures of Effectiveness

The project results were also estimated from the Synchro™ Version 8.0 models that were used to develop the new traffic signal timing plans. For each corridor, the calibrated model of the before timing was compared with the calibrated model of the final timing. The measures of effectiveness (MOEs) that were compared included total signal delay and fuel consumption along with three categories of emissions (CO, NOx, and VOC). The following improvements were estimated by the Synchro™ Version 8.0 comparison:

- **Signal Delay**
  - Weekday
    - 6,975 overall vehicle-hour reduction per day
  - Saturday
    - 1,989 overall vehicle-hour reduction per day
- **Fuel Consumption**
  - Weekday
    - 3,594 overall gallon reduction per day
  - Saturday
    - 842 overall gallon reduction per day
- **Emissions**
  - Weekday
    - VOC reduction of approximately 25,500 grams per day
    - CO reduction of approximately 1,473,500 grams per day
    - NOx reduction of approximately 75,100 grams per day
  - Saturday
    - VOC reduction of approximately 8,500 grams per day
    - CO reduction of approximately 285,100 grams per day
    - NOx reduction of approximately 19,300 grams per day
5.3 Estimated Economic Benefits

The following rationale was used to estimate the daily user savings from the new timing plans:

- On each weekday there will be:
  - Two hours of benefit from the AM peak period timing plan
  - Two hours of benefit from the PM peak period timing plan
  - Five hours of benefit from the midday period timing plan
  - To be conservative, no benefit is assumed from other hours of the day even though most of the corridors operate the new timing plans for at least 12 hours per day.
- On Saturday, there will be four hours of benefit from the timing plan.

For the purpose of economic analysis of transportation improvements, NCTCOG’s current value is $12.50 per vehicle-hour of delay as reflected in Mobility 2035 - 2013 Amendment.

For each corridor, the “before” and “after” Synchro™ Version 8.0 models were compared for each of the timing plans. Considering the composite total signal delay for all corridors and using the above-described rationale, the estimated user benefit is $87,191 per weekday. Assuming 248 weekdays per year, this equates to an annual savings of approximately $21.6 million.

The attached Table 1 provides a summary of the project benefits. The data provided include the following statistics per travel time route: number of signals, average daily traffic volume, and project benefits (reductions in travel time, stops, and delay). Also provided were the following statistics per corridor: number of signals, project benefits as derived from the Synchro™ Version 8.0 models (reductions in total signal delay, stops, travel time, fuel consumed, and emissions). Daily user savings are calculated using $12.50 per vehicle-hour of delay and total signal delay (veh-hours) from the Synchro™ Version 8.0.

The greatest per-intersection improvements were attained in Corridor 5 (Old Denton Road), Corridor 6 (Belt Line Road), Corridor 18 (Preston Road), Corridor 20 (US 380), and Corridor 22 (US 377). These corridors all saw daily delay savings of more than $500 per intersection. These benefits were realized through improved phasing, adjusted cycle lengths, and improved coordination between intersections.
### Table 1  Summary of Project Benefits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Corridor</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Contract Number of Signals</th>
<th>Average Daily Traffic</th>
<th>Travel Time (seconds)</th>
<th>Steps</th>
<th>Daily (seconds)</th>
<th>Total Signal Delay (veh-hour)</th>
<th>From Travel Time Runs</th>
<th>From Synchro</th>
<th>Daily User Savings</th>
<th>Per Intersection</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Old Denton Road</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>24,272</td>
<td>-700 -7 -635 -694 -9,102 -672 -84 -459 25,585 1,892</td>
<td>5,876.25</td>
<td>788.75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belt Line Road</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>26,289</td>
<td>-56 -2 -52 -181 -12,480 -464 -341 -2,512 -109,420 -10,180</td>
<td>2,625.00</td>
<td>161.79</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGBT Access Road</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>23,735</td>
<td>-257 -10 -239 38 543 160 114 -58 2,980 2,130</td>
<td>480.00</td>
<td>40.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trinity Boulevard</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11,146</td>
<td>-808 -20 -725 -98 -24,165 -120 -104 -940 -87,694 2,469</td>
<td>1,223.75</td>
<td>87.41</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walnut Hill Lane</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>28,700</td>
<td>-357 -12 -354 116 -6,807 489 -7 -407 -15,679 917</td>
<td>1,493.75</td>
<td>242.29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Royal Lane</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13,379</td>
<td>-443 -11 -420 -62 -12,235 -73 -58 -761 45,272 2,587</td>
<td>770.00</td>
<td>128.33</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SH 356</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21,504</td>
<td>-287 -7 -230 82 3,450 103 55 1,317 34,831 3,532</td>
<td>1,028.75</td>
<td>148.99</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northgate Drive</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12,694</td>
<td>-420 -12 -385 34 -4,400 36 1 -96 -8,933 639</td>
<td>-421.25</td>
<td>-70.21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preston Road</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14,392</td>
<td>-2,930 19,580 -2,711 -406 3,468 101,924 15,082</td>
<td>36,627.50</td>
<td>832.44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legacy Drive</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14,392</td>
<td>-2,930 19,580 -2,711 -406 3,468 101,924 15,082</td>
<td>36,627.50</td>
<td>832.44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring Creek Parkway</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14,392</td>
<td>-2,930 19,580 -2,711 -406 3,468 101,924 15,082</td>
<td>36,627.50</td>
<td>832.44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parker Road</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14,392</td>
<td>-2,930 19,580 -2,711 -406 3,468 101,924 15,082</td>
<td>36,627.50</td>
<td>832.44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Park Boulevard</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14,392</td>
<td>-2,930 19,580 -2,711 -406 3,468 101,924 15,082</td>
<td>36,627.50</td>
<td>832.44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piano Parkway</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14,392</td>
<td>-2,930 19,580 -2,711 -406 3,468 101,924 15,082</td>
<td>36,627.50</td>
<td>832.44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SH 183</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14,392</td>
<td>-2,930 19,580 -2,711 -406 3,468 101,924 15,082</td>
<td>36,627.50</td>
<td>832.44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US 380</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>38,399</td>
<td>-663 -15 -627 -342 -21,143 -311 -110 2,873 34,278 9,260</td>
<td>4,271.25</td>
<td>533.91</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SH 78</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>28,434</td>
<td>-172 -6 -176 -160 -9,596 -142 -18 -2,640 -46,828 -3,516</td>
<td>2,005.00</td>
<td>250.63</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FM 1220/SH 199</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>28,700</td>
<td>-244 -11 -227 -407 -33,265 -395 -146 831 -45,905 1,736</td>
<td>5,086.25</td>
<td>231.19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wheatland Road</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>27,867</td>
<td>-164 -1 -160 462 -10,787 405 0 -822 42,134 -5,240</td>
<td>-5,768.75</td>
<td>480.73</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>31,086</td>
<td>-164 8 160 166 2,764 217 90 -1,404 34,992 8,520</td>
<td>2,075.00</td>
<td>172.82</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Weekday</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>-945 -200 -8185 -6,975 -306,265 -6,228 -3,594 25,471 -1,473,485 -75,053</td>
<td>871,912.5</td>
<td>4,598.17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note A: Based on the following hours of benefit per weekday from the three timing plans: 2 hours per weekday for AM Peak plan; 5 hours per weekday for the Midday plan; and 2 hours per weekday for PM Peak plan

Note B: Based on $12.50 per hour of Synchro™ total signal delay

NCTCOG Regional Traffic Signal Retiming Program
Final Technical Memorandum

HDR Engineering, Inc. 5 4/30/2014